Regular Meeting Minutes for December 12, 2018

Members Present: Josh Chilson, Pam Cole, Rob Collins, Jennifer Dumke, Thomas Keller, Rachael Meyerink, Lynn Remmers, Lura Roti, Shelly Sjovold

Members Absent: Alex Halbach

Staff Present: Diane deKoeyer, Urban Planner, BoHP Staff Liaison, Mike Cooper, Director of Planning & Development Services

Public in Attendance: Mary Kane, Cathedral Historic District, Monica Hemming, Cathedral Historic District, Jerry Noonan, Cathedral Historic District, Sarah Spencer, Cathedral Historic District, Deb Straub, Cathedral Historic District, Stephanie Richter, Cathedral Historic District, Liz Meyer, Advantage Investments, Tim Audus, Raven Industries, Elizabeth Ebert, Raven Industries, Chad Kucker, Confluence, Greg McMahan, Jans Corp., Ted Weiland, Homeowner, Kathy Weiland, Homeowner, Jim Cynkar, Homeowner, Sharon Cynkar, Homeowner

1. Call to Order and Quorum Determination
Chairperson Rachael Meyerink called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

2. Welcome and Introductions
Chairperson Rachael Meyerink welcomed board members and guests, and gave introductory comments.

3. Approval of Regular Agenda
Chairperson Rachael Meyerink requested a motion to approve the regular agenda. Member Lynn Remmers made the motion to approve the regular agenda. Member Shelly Sjovold seconded the motion. The motion to approve the regular agenda passed unanimously.
4. Approval of the November 14, 2018 Meeting Minutes
Chairperson Rachael Meyerink requested a motion to approve the November 14, 2018, meeting minutes. Member Rob Collins made the motion to approve the minutes as presented. Member Lura Roti seconded the motion. The motion to approve the November 14, 2018, meeting minutes passed unanimously.

5. Public Input on Non-Agenda Items (five-minute period)
There was no public input received.

6. New Business
A. 101 E 6th Street
   Old Courthouse Historic District
   Tim Audus, Raven Industries - Applicant
   (Board action required)

   Member Rob Collins recused himself from this item and left the meeting.

   Tim Audus, Corporate Facilities Manager with Raven provided an overview of Raven’s history of owning, occupying and rehabilitating the Manchester Biscuit Company building at 205 E. 6th St. and the building they are requesting to raze at 101 E. 6th St. Raven’s request is to raze the structure to construct a surface level parking lot. They have a demand for more employee and summer intern parking. The parking lot is and will offer free parking for after hours and weekends for other businesses and venues downtown. The proposed surface parking lot would be temporary until Raven develops the site for a future building that would also include parking.

   Member Lura Roti asked about the condition of the building and if it could be rehabilitated for use or to leave the shell of the building for parking inside. Tim explained that the structural columns in the building wouldn’t allow for parking and due to inefficiencies in the building it would be challenging for Raven to continue to use the building for anything. There are a couple different levels in the building, ceilings are fairly low and hasn’t served a purpose for several years now.

   Member Tom Keller stated that if the board decides to approve the demolition for a surface parking lot, they wouldn’t want to see it remain a parking lot for the next twenty years. Tim Audus responded that he can’t make a commitment as to when they will rebuild but they do have concept plans for a new building, but don’t know when they will construct.

   Chair Rachael Meyerink reviewed the national register summary of the district, building and the proposed surface parking lot. She feels that a surface lot is intrusive on the pedestrian experience downtown and we’ve lost several significant historic buildings to parking with urban renewal.

   Director Cooper reviewed the history of the site, downtown development, future plans for Phillips Ave. and integrating historic monuments and features to make Phillips Ave. on the north end a pedestrian friendly experience. The property at this location is too valuable to leave as a parking lot and should be developed for
higher density use. Raven’s campus has been expanded and with the success of other buildings like Jones 421, the Cascade Building and the Levitt Pavilion, has created a momentum on the north end of Phillips that will continue. The trend of downtown is developments like Village on the River as mixed use. Director Cooper would like to see all surface parking lots eliminated in the future and developed into mixed use buildings.

Diane deKoeyer reminded the board that when Raven comes back with a new building project, the applicant is required to meet the Secretary of Interior Standards for new construction for the Old Courthouse and Warehouse Historic District.

Member Pam Cole reviewed Raven’s letter in the packet regarding the dilapidated building and questioned if there is anything salvageable like the brick? Tim Audus reported that although the building isn’t ready to fall down, he didn’t know if the building could be added onto.

Member Lura Roti reported that one of the SOI standards is that deteriorated historic features should be repaired rather than replaced and the board follows the standards for their decisions.

Member Lynn Remmers, asked if Raven has a rideshare program or alternative parking programs that could minimize the need for the expanded parking lot. Tim responded that Raven already provides ridesharing and parking for green vehicles on-site, but that it is especially difficult in the summers when they hire interns and add to their workforce.

Member Shelly Sjovold noted that Epicosity located on Main Ave. renovated a one story building that they were able to make it work. She further commented that she would love to see Raven’s building maintained, rather than razed.

Member Lura Roti responded that this building is a physical record of its time and use. Designed as a single story in the Moderne architectural movement and that the windows represent the new automobile movement, the building shows the city’s history. She feels that it would be adverse to allow the building to be taken down.

Member Pam Cole said that with the multiple additions to the building that the history of the building hasn’t been seen in a long time. The building has gone above and beyond its life and should be let go to allow for advancement and other opportunities at this location.

Member Shelly Sjovold said that her experience at the museum and the loss of historic buildings downtown, slippery slope having lost buildings in the past and regretting those decisions now.

Rachael, demo for surface parking gap on Phillips Ave. would have adverse effect on downtown.
Member Lura made the motion that demo the building at 320 W. Phillips would have an adverse effect based on the following standards: 2, 3, and 6. Shelly seconded the motion. The following members voted “Yes” that the demolition would have an adverse effect on the historic district were: Lura Roti, Jennifer Dumke, Shelly Sjovold and Josh Chilson. The following members voted “No” that the demolition would have an adverse effect were: Pam Cole, Tom Keller, and Lynn Remmers. The motion passed unanimously, therefore the request by Raven to demolish the building at 101 E 6th Street is denied.

B. 201 E. 20th Street
   All Saints Historic District
   Greg McMahan, Jans Corp.
   Ted & Kathy Weiland, Homeowners
   (Board action required)

Diane reviewed the case report requested by the state to review alternatives for the applicants request for a garage and second story addition. The approved motion at the October meeting was that the two-story addition to the garage and house does not have an adverse effect to the historic district with a reveal, salvaged brick for a soldier course and the use of stucco at the first and second stories.

In the case report provided, the applicant included a brick photo that is complimentary to the existing brick in lieu of the all stucco proposal. This was the applicant’s original request.

The applicant and board members discussed the use of a reveal versus a 3” setback of the west façade for the addition. Ted Weiland noted that there is a garage addition at the northeast corner of S. Phillips Ave. and E. 4th Ave. and the brick he is requesting approval on for his garage, is the same as this one.

Member Tom Keller reviewed the proposed contrasting brick and found that it is different enough that it doesn’t match the original brick.

Member Rob Collins reported that he has concern about the closeness of the addition to the neighboring property and the rhythm of open area between the homes. He noted that although he agrees with the combination of brick and stucco for the addition he would be voting “No” due to the SOI for Setting of the addition.

Member Tom Keller made the motion that the proposed two-story addition to 201 E. 20th St. with the contrasting proposed brick at the first level and stucco at the second story with a 3” setback would not have an adverse effect on the All Saints Historic District. Member Pam Cole seconded the motion. Six members voted “Yes” and one member voted “No”. The motion passed unanimously.

Member Tom Keller left the meeting.
C. 209 E. 19th St. Jim and Sharon Cynkar, Homeowners
All Saints Historic District
(Board action required)

The homeowners requested vinyl replacement windows for the structure 209 E. 10th St. Diane passed an additional photo that the homeowner provided of a vinyl window on the house.

The homeowner provided three different quotes ranging from $10,000 to $40,000 for the replacement windows. They have spent quite a bit of time and money already on the house and would like the cost savings to replace the 21 windows with vinyl.

Member Rachael Meyerink asked if all the existing windows were deteriorated beyond repair. The homeowners responded that anything could be repaired, but they would rather replace the windows with a cost effective alternative.

Diane reported that the standards require only “street facing facades” to follow the standards.

Member Lura Roti mentioned that there are funding opportunities available to assist with the cost to repair windows. Member Rachael Meyerink spoke about her experience of owning a historic home and repairing wood window that cost approximately $50 a window. The homeowner reported that the cost of new wood or clad windows were prohibitive.

Diane reminded the homeowners that an aluminum clad window is acceptable and saves costs from all wood windows. This is a compromise over the vinyl windows. The SOI indicate that “like materials with like materials” are required in a rehabilitation.

The homeowners reported that they did not know the home was in a historic district with rules for making changes when they purchased the property for rehabilitation as a rental property. If they did, they may not have purchased the property.

Member Jennifer Dumke made the motion that replacing the existing windows with the requested vinyl windows would have an adverse effect on the All Saints Historic District. Member Rob Collins seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

Diane and board members reviewed funding opportunities with the applicant and mentioned that information would be sent for their use.

Member Rob Collins left the meeting.

7. Other Business
A. PR Campaign
Chairperson Rachael Meyerink reminded the board members that a committee meeting to discuss the Public Relations Campaign is meeting on Friday, December 7 at 8:00am at the City Center regarding the May 8th meeting.

Jerry Noonan reported that he owns three properties in a historic district and a new tax law allows for opportunities in a hub zone or a low-income census tract for investors to realize huge capital gains. A QOF (qualified opportunity fund) allows the investor to deposit the capital gains that can then be used in one of the census tract areas for renovation or new construction. The capital gain can be deferred for up to twenty years.

Deb Straub attended the meeting in response to the Cathedral Historic District invitation from the board. She’s had damage to her stucco on the back side of her house. Member Lura Roti offered advice on a tax moratorium and a Deadwood Grant. Diane sent links to this information the day following the meeting.

8. Adjournment
With no further business, the Board of Historic Preservation meeting was adjourned at approximately 5:50 pm.