Board of Historic Preservation

Wednesday, May 29, 2019
4:00 pm
City Center, Room 110
231 North Dakota Avenue
Sioux Falls, SD

MEETING ASSISTANCE. Upon request, accommodations for meetings will be provided for persons with disabilities. Please contact the Human Relations office, located on first floor of City Hall, 224 West Ninth Street, Sioux Falls, SD, at 367-8745 (voice) or 367-7039 (TDD) 48 hours in advance of the meeting.

AGENDA

Facilitators: Rachael Meyerink, Board Chair
Rob Collins, Vice Chair

Staff Liaison: Diane deKoeyer, Neighborhood Planner

1. CALL TO ORDER & QUORUM DETERMINATION
   Chair

2. WELCOME & INTRODUCTIONS
   Chair

3. APPROVAL OF REGULAR AGENDA
   Chair

4. APPROVAL OF APRIL 10, 2019 MEETING MINUTES
   Chair

4. PUBLIC INPUT ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS
   (5-minute comment period per individual)

5. NEW BUSINESS
   A. New House Build, 1710 S. 4th Ave.
      McKennan Park Historic District
      (board action required)
      Jarrod Smart Construction

6. OTHER BUSINESS
   A. New Board Member Introduction
   B. Historic Preservation Reception Review
   Diane
   Diane / Lura

7. ADJOURNMENT
Promoting the use and conservation of historic properties for the education, inspiration, pleasure and enrichment of the citizens of Sioux Falls

Regular Meeting Minutes for April 10, 2019

Members Present:
Josh Chilson
Rob Collins
Alex Halbach
Thomas Keller
Rachael Meyerink
Lura Roti
Lynn Remmers, 4:09

Members Absent:
Pam Cole
Jennifer Dumke
Shelly Sjovold

Staff Present:
Diane deKoeyer, Neighborhood Planner, BoHP Staff Liaison

Public in Attendance:
Jarrod Smart, Jarrod Smart Construction
Nick Kapperman, Jarrod Smart Construction

1. Call to Order and Quorum Determination
Chairperson Rachael Meyerink called the meeting to order at 4:02 p.m.

2. Welcome and Introductions
Chairperson Rachael Meyerink welcomed Board members and guests and gave introductory comments.

3. Approval of Regular Agenda
Chairperson Rachael Meyerink requested a motion to approve the regular agenda. Member Tom Keller made the motion to approve the regular agenda. Member Alex Halbach seconded the motion. The motion to approve the regular agenda passed unanimously.

4. Approval of the March 13, 2019, Meeting Minutes
Chairperson Rachael Meyerink requested a motion to approve the March 13, 2019, meeting minutes. Member Tom Keller made the motion to approve the minutes as presented. Member Alex Halbach seconded the motion. The motion to approve the March 13, 2019, meeting minutes passed unanimously.

5. Public Input on Non-Agenda Items (five-minute period)
There was no public input received.
6. New Business
   A. 1309 South Phillips Avenue
      All Saints Historic District
      (Board action required)

      Jarrod Smart and Nick Kapperman, JSC

      Nick Kapperman handed out updated drawings by the homeowner, Patrick Kelly, for the construction of a new garage. The existing garage is not original to the house. Jarrod Smart Construction has been working on the rehabilitation of the home since 2017.

      The existing garage does not have a frost footing and the homeowner would also like to add a basement below the new structure. The updated drawings show a hayloft door above the two garage doors on the south façade.

      Discussion centered on the proposed hayloft door and whether a window would be more appropriate in its place and whether the overall height of the "doors" were too tall. Based on the updated drawings, Board members requested additional vertical battens above the hayloft doors and removing the exposed end beam.

      Jarrod proposed the following differences of the new garage to the historic home: The new garage will not have a soldier brick course at the base, garage corbels will be new, eaves at gable ends will not have turndowns, and the stucco finish will be a lighter texture than the house.

      Further discussion ensued regarding the windows above the hayloft doors. The recommendation was to match their size to that of the windows in the garage doors for consistency. There was also discussion on what the doors and batten trim would be constructed of. Jarrod reported that he uses a product called Dura Trim that is more durable than wood.

      Board member Rob Collins made the motion that the proposed garage would not have an adverse effect on the All Saints Historic District with the following caveat:

      - The end beam would be eliminated on the south façade.
      - The window above the hayloft doors would be the same size as those on the garage doors.
      - There is a discernable texture difference between the garage and house stucco.
      - Add battens above the hayloft doors.

      Member Tom Keller seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously with the remaining Board members.
B. 224 West Ninth Street
   City Hall, Downtown Historic District and Individual Listing on the National Register of Historic Places

   Diane deKoeyer

   Mayor TenHaken’s Office has requested artwork in the lobby of City Hall for rotating local artists’ artwork. Ivy Oland Dandar has submitted a report to the Visual Arts Commission for location of art and proposed sizes.

   A proposed system for hanging artwork requires drilling into the marble walls. Other options included hanging it from the plaster ceiling and into the wood or plaster molding. Representatives from the State Historic Preservation Office were in Sioux Falls last month and on site for review. Their recommendation was to not drill into the molding for the track system. The recommendation from City staff (Facilities Maintenance and Planning) was that locating the track 3 inches below the molding would decrease potential damage of chipping or cracking the marble. Staff recommended to the Board to approve the track system being drilled into the marble.

   There was discussion of the Board and staff, and Member Tom Keller made the motion that drilling into the marble would not have an adverse effect on the historic walls. Member Alex Halbach seconded the motion, and the motion passed with all but one of the remaining Board members.

7. Other Business
   A. Hayes Historic District Q&A
      No discussion.

   B. Mayor’s Preservation Award
      Director of Planning and Development Services Mike Cooper requested the nomination of the East Side Fire Station & Library for the Mayor’s Award for Historic Preservation this year. Todd Stone purchased the building from the City in 2017 and has been rehabilitating the building since. The project has also been listed to the National Register of Historic Places. The Board is in agreement with the nomination and will be sent to the Mayor’s Office for consideration.

      The deadline for further submittals is April 19, 2019.

8. Adjournment
   With no further business, the Board of Historic Preservation meeting was adjourned at approximately 5:15 p.m.
24:52:07:04. Standards for new construction and additions in historic districts. New construction or additions within a historic district must comply with The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties as incorporated by reference in § 24:52:07:02. In addition the following standards apply:

(1) Compatibility of design. Massing, size, and scale of new construction must be compatible with surrounding historic buildings. Overall architectural features of new construction must be of contemporary design which does not directly mimic historic buildings. Architectural elements such as windows, doors, and cornices must be similar in rhythm, pattern, and scale to comparable elements in adjacent historic buildings. The overall visual appearance of new construction may not dominate or be distracting to the surrounding historic landscape;

(2) Height. The height of new buildings or additions to existing buildings may not exceed a standard variance of ten percent of the average height of historic buildings on both sides of the street where proposed new construction is to be located;

(3) Width. The width of new buildings or additions to existing buildings must be similar to adjacent historic buildings;

(4) Proportion. The relationship between the height and width of new buildings or additions to existing buildings must be similar in proportion to existing historic buildings. The proportion of openings in the facades of new construction or additions must be compatible with similar openings in adjacent historic buildings;

(5) Rhythm and scale. The rhythm, placement, and scale of openings, prominent vertical and horizontal members, and separation of buildings which are present in adjacent historic buildings must be incorporated into the design of new buildings or additions to existing buildings;

(6) Materials. Materials which make up new buildings or additions to existing buildings must complement materials present in nearby historic properties. New materials must be of similar color, texture, reflective qualities, and scale as historical materials present in the historic district;

(7) Color. The colors of materials, trim, ornament, and details used in new construction must be similar to those colors on existing historic buildings or must match colors used in previous historical periods for identical features within the historic district;

(8) Details and ornament. The details and ornament on new buildings or additions to existing buildings must be of contemporary design that is complementary to those features of similar physical or decorative function on adjacent historic buildings;

(9) Roof shape and skyline. The roof shape and skyline of new construction must be similar to that of existing historic buildings;

(10) Setting. The relationship of new buildings or additions to existing buildings must maintain the traditional placement of historic buildings in relation to streets, sidewalks, natural topography, and lot lines; and

(11) Landscaping and ground cover. Retaining walls, fences, plants, and other landscaping elements that are part of new construction may not introduce elements which are out of character with the setting of the historic district.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Project Review</strong></th>
<th>May 29th, 2019</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Property Address</strong></td>
<td>1710 S. 4th Ave.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Property Owner</strong></td>
<td>Mike and Jacque McNamara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Historic District</strong></td>
<td>McKennan Park Historic District</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Year Built</strong></td>
<td>Proposed 2019</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Category</strong></td>
<td>New Construction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Project</strong></td>
<td>New construction of a single family home at a vacant lot.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>National Register</strong></td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Project Representative</strong></td>
<td>Jarrod Smart, Contractor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Neighbor Notification</strong></td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Staff Comments**      | The contractor has provided standards and criteria for each item listed on the Secretary of Interior Standards for New Construction.  
The proposed house plan is complimentary to the existing historic district and homes within the McKennan Park area.  
The BoHP will apply the Secretary of Interior Standards for New Construction for review of this project. |
| **Board Action**        | Required                                           |
| **Photos & Plans**      | See attached                                       |
The following information is provided by Jarrod Smart Construction

In order to prove compliance of the proposed new house with the required standards for new construction and additions in historic districts, the applicable standards are listed below. Directly following each standard is an explanation detailing how the proposed project meets or exceeds the required standard. For the purposes of this application, approximate measurements of existing houses in the historic district were taken from the City of Sioux Falls GIS map using the measurement tool. All measurements are approximate. For clarification within this narrative, the term adjacent should be defined as adjoining, neighboring, close to, near to, next to and/or proximate to.


**Standard:** Massing, size, and scale of new construction must be compatible with surrounding historic buildings. Overall architectural features of new construction must be contemporary design which does not directly mimic historic buildings. Architectural elements, such as windows, doors, and cornices, must be similar in rhythm, pattern, and scale to comparable elements in adjacent historic buildings. The overall appearance of new construction may not dominate or be distracting to the surrounding historic landscape.

**Approval Criteria:** The proposed new house is of contemporary design, meets current building codes and zoning ordinances, and the overall mass of the house is like that of other houses in the neighborhood. The story and a half design with various shorter roof planes help to keep the scale of the house complementary to other houses in the McKennan Park neighborhood giving it a balanced feel without a dominating or distracting appearance. The house was designed specifically for this lot and fits appropriately while meeting or exceeding all setback requirements and considering the houses and accessory structures on neighboring lots in order to maintain the current use and function of other houses as they currently exist. The proposed house complements the architectural elements of other houses in the neighborhood with respect to the rhythm and placement of windows and doors by using similar window placement and muntin patterns as seen in other nearby houses. The turret is one of the unique features of this house that makes it compatible with surrounding historic houses but does not directly mimic any other houses in the neighborhood. Cornice and wall heights have been intentionally sized to draw the mass of the house into scale to complement other houses in the neighborhood, while still maintaining current energy and building codes. This house is designed to be wheelchair accessible specific for an occupant who will live in the house. The accessible design of the house given the area of the lot that is buildable dictates the maximum elevation the finished floor of the house can be established at. The elevation above grade was considered when designing this house to incorporate front steps leading to the front door to promote a design that complements neighboring houses.
2. **Height.**

**Standard:** The height of new buildings or additions to existing buildings may not exceed a standard variance of 10 percent of the average height of historic buildings on both sides of the street where proposed new construction is to be located.

**Approval Criteria:** The proposed new house is a single-story ranch house but is designed to appear as a story and a half from the exterior which allows this house to blend well with other historic houses in the McKennan Park neighborhood. The tallest point of the roof (not the finial) of the house is approximately 29'-10" above grade in the front of the house, which is estimated to be slightly shorter than the tallest point of the house next to it (1614 4th Ave.). The proposed house exceeds the standard variance of the average height of the house directly next to it because it is a story and a half house not a two-story house. The proposed house does have an average height that is within the range of average heights located within the McKennan Park Historic District (comparing the lowest average height to the highest average height). The impact of the height of the proposed house falling outside (shorter than) the standard variance of 10 percent is positive in that it reduces the mass of the structure at the corner and allows the house to blend well with the house next to it along 26th St. (1719 S. 5th Ave.), thus blending well the southeast corner of the McKennan Park Historic District with the neighborhood on 5th Ave.

3. **Width.**

**Standard:** The width of new buildings or additions to existing buildings must be similar to adjacent historic buildings.

**Approval Criteria:** At the widest points including the garage, the proposed new house from East to West and North to South are approximately 92' and 108', respectively, which is shown on page A-1 of the drawing set. The prominent view of the house from 4th Avenue gives the appearance that the house is approximately 74' 6" wide, with the garage tucked behind to appear detached in order to blend well with other houses in the area. The houses referenced below are houses in the McKennan Park Historical District with similar widths.

![503 E 21st Street](image)

*Approximately 102.5' (North and South)*
503 E 21st Street
Approximately 74.9' (East and West)

305 E 26th Street
Approximately 88.2' (East and West)

1325 S 2nd Avenue
Approximately 98.9' (East and West)
4. Proportion.

**Standard:** The relationship between the height and width of new buildings or additions to existing buildings must be similar in proportion to existing historic buildings. The proportion of openings in the facades of new construction or additions must be compatible with similar openings in adjacent historic buildings.

**Approval Criteria:** In order to maintain proportion of openings in the façade of the proposed house to neighboring structures, wall plane sizes were designed to be proportional and complementary to other houses in the neighborhood, allowing window and door openings to be proportional to the walls in which they are placed. Naturally, with various jogs in the footprint of the home, multiple roof lines and roof heights were created, but most tie into one main roof line that runs from the front to the back of the house. This house is designed for an occupant needing a service van for a wheelchair which requires a taller garage door. To minimize the impact of a taller garage door to the front elevation of the house, cornice heights were adjusted and brought down to bring the mass of the house down in an effort to maintain the proportion of this house to historic houses in the neighborhood. The front door includes two sidelights, with several window groupings on the main floor similar to nearby houses, the appearance of dormers on the front of the house, keep the architectural interest in the front elevation of the house proportional, and the two-stall garage door visible from 4th Avenue minimizes the impact of the garage to the front elevation of the house in order to maintain proportionality to other houses in the neighborhood. The front porch roof is supported by columns that are proportional in size and mass to the span of roof they are supporting and to the service height of the column itself.
5. **Rhythm and scale.**

**Standard:** The rhythm, placement, and scale of openings, prominent vertical and horizontal members, and separation of buildings which are present in adjacent historic buildings must be incorporated into the design of new builds or additions to existing buildings.

**Approval Criteria:** The proposed new house is designed to include prominent features to the front of the house to help blend the new house into the neighborhood. The new house is planned to include three dormers, a unique roof fare, turret, and a covered front porch with columns wrapped in brick at the base. All of which complement other unique architectural details around the park without copying details that already exist. The garage is set back to appear separate from the house similar to surrounding houses with detached garages.
1523 S 2nd Avenue – Prominent Front Door/ Columns with Brick Base

1325 S 2nd Avenue – Slightly Flared Eave/ Multiple Roof Lines

1600 S 4th Avenue – Porch with Roof Support by Columns with Brick Base/ Bird Box Soffit Transition/ Heavy Fascia
Materials.

**Standard:** Materials which make up new buildings or additions to existing buildings must complement materials present in nearby historic properties. New materials must be of similar color, texture, reflective qualities, and scale as historical materials present in the historic district.

**Approval Criteria:** In order to maintain the integrity of the historic district, the proposed new house will be constructed using the following materials:

- Hardie Artisan Lap Siding on majority of exterior
- Hardie Fiber Cement Soffit (white)
- T&G Pine Front Porch Ceiling
- No. 1 Cedar Shingles on dormers and turret walls
- Marvin Next Gen Double Hung and Picture Windows (white)
- C.H.I. Insulated Steel Garage Doors with Composite Overlay (to be painted)
- Miratec and Dura Trim (for exterior trim boards and fascia to be painted white)
- GAF Sienna Asphalt Shingles – diamond pattern in a dark, earth-tone color

6. Color.

**Standard:** The color of materials, trim, ornament, and details used in new construction must be similar to those colors on existing historic buildings or must match colors used in previous historical periods for identical features within the historic district.

**Approval Criteria:** The proposed new house will be painted a shade of grey, with trim accents painted white. The neutral colors will blend nicely with the surrounding houses.

The siding will be in neutral gray tones with white siding trim and window trim, the shingles will be a dark earth-tone color, cedar shingles will be gray, exterior brick for front porch columns and chimney are to be brick in a classic color based on brick color and texture offerings manufactured today. The neutral, historic color palette blended with natural earth elements will blend nicely with the surrounding houses.

7. Details and ornament.

**Standard:** The details and ornament on new buildings or additions to existing buildings must be of contemporary design that is complementary to those features of similar physical or decorative function of adjacent historic buildings.

**Approval Criteria:** Without copying or taking away from the authenticity of the contributing houses in the McKennan Park area, the proposed house will incorporate details and ornamental features suitable for the historic neighborhood setting in which it will be built. The following features have been included: prominent front gable with a flared roof eave, barreled roofline pronouncing the alignment of the front door under the front porch roof with the feature window in the gable wall plane above, paneled columns with brick column bases, chimney through the roof with a chimney cap, round window, dormers, classic front gable window arrangement, paneled gable wall details, decorative corbels, thick eave and rake fascia, a radiused transition from the rake fascia to the eave fascia return, an intentional variety of wall cladding textures (cedar shingles, siding, panels and brick), and covered front porch area. Half round gutters with round downspouts are planned for the house pending budget compliance.
503 E 21st Street – Brick Chimney/ Wood Overlay Garage Doors

1525 S 2nd Avenue – Cedar Shingles/ Covered Front Porch

1523 S 2nd Avenue – Columns with Brick/ Planter Boxes
8. **Roof shape and skyline.**

**Standard:** The roof shape and skyline of new construction must be similar to that of existing historic buildings.

**Approval Criteria:** The roof of the proposed house has a single main ridge line running from the front to the back of the home. There are various other roof lines that tie into this main ridge. The pitch of the roof varies from 20:12 at the turret roof down to 4:12 at the front porch roof. The blend of roof pitches complements the other houses in the neighborhood. The blending of the high and low roof pitches is a distinguishing detail of the following historic houses:

- **525 E 21st Street**
- **305 E 26th Street**

**Standard:** The relationship of new buildings or additions to existing buildings must maintain the traditional placement of historic buildings in relation to streets, sidewalks, natural topography, and lot lines.

**Approval Criteria:** The proposed new house is respectful of all setbacks and existing buildings as shown on page A-7 of the drawing set. The front wall plane of the proposed new house is very close to being in line with the adjacent houses on 4th Avenue and 26th Street, while the front porch is positioned closer to the street as with other homes in the district, maintaining the traditional placement of the house in relation to streets and sidewalks and complementing the overall look of the street. The garage setback gives the appearance of a detached garage similar to many of the historic houses. Below are two models shown next to the existing buildings. These models are meant to represent the approximate appearance will be when looking East and North, respectively.
10. Landscaping and ground cover.

**Standard:** Retaining walls, fences, plants, and other landscaping elements that are part of new construction may not introduce elements which are out of character with the setting of the historic district.

**Approval Criteria:** The proposed new house will not include any retaining walls at this time as they are not needed which is similar to other houses in the area. Additionally, plants and landscaping will be made to complement others in the area although, please note that a landscape plan is not within the scope of work Jarrod Smart Construction has been hired to do at this time. Grading done to the property will be done in cooperation with the city of Sioux Falls Engineering Department and any standards we need to meet with respect to grading. The rear of the lot is a bit low, so there will likely be some material added to promote positive drainage away from the home and to promote drainage to the property line, and then ultimately to the streets and storm drain. Existing trees, plants, and shrubbery will be disturbed as little as possible.
North Neighbor, South Facade